

**Cincinnati Preschool Promise
Board of Managers**

Minutes of Regular Meeting, March 19, 2019
4:00PM – 6:00PM

Board Members Present:

Father Michael Graham (Chair), Cheryl Rose (Treasurer), Deborah Allsop (Secretary), Yousuf Ahmad, Dr.P.H., Christine Fisher, Anthony Hobson, Micah Kamrass, Toilynn O'Neal, O'dell Owens, Laura Sanregret and Sallie Westheimer.

Board Members Absent:

Terri England, Gary Lindgren, Pastor Ennis Tait and Vanessa White.

Observers Present:

Greg Landsman – Cincinnati Promise Forward
Vera Brooks – Cincinnati Public Schools
Leshia Lyman – Success by 6

Cincinnati Preschool Promise Staff Present (CPP):

Shiloh Turner - Executive Director
Brittnii Pina – Quality Improvement Manager
Florence Malone – Outreach Manager
LaKeisa Ealy – Marketing and Community Engagement Manger
Lauren Shifman – Policy and Program Manager
Lesley Nunn – Senior Administrative Assistant

Cincinnati Preschool Promise Staff Absent:

Héctor Polanco – Finance Director

Members of the Public:

Lisa Garafalo – SWOAEYC;
Vanessa Frytag – 4C for Children;
Emily Fay – 4C for Children;
Heather Gerker – Strive Partnership;
Susan Grosse – Early Learning University;
Kim Ginn – 4C for Children;
Jill Smith – The Children's Home;
Bianca Edwards – AMOS;
Ellen Vera - CUCI

1. Welcome, Call to Order

Father Graham welcomed Board members, members of the public and officially opened up the meeting at 4:05 PM. He mentioned that there was a slight amendment to the agenda that was emailed out. The amendment is the CPP Final Audit report will be presented for approval at tonight's meeting.

ACTION: A motion to approve the agenda was made by O'dell Owens and seconded by Laura Sanregret. The motion was unanimously approved.

2. Review and Approval of Minutes of February 19, 2019

Father Graham asked the Board for comments on the minutes of February 19, 2019. Deborah Allsop mentioned that she had given Shiloh Turner and Lesley Nunn her revisions.

Father Graham requested a motion to approve minutes of February 19, 2019.

ACTION: A motion to approve the revised minutes of February 19, 2019 was made by Deborah Allsop and seconded by Cheryl Rose. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. Mission Moment:

Beverley McGlasson, Little Blossoms Site Administrator and Louise Williamston of YMCA Christ Child presented this month's mission moment.

- At Little Blossoms, there are 62 children being served under CPP. Without CPP, 62 might not have been able to get access to quality preschools.
- Also there are 7 teachers at Little Blossoms receiving teacher grants which has led to increased morale amongst the teachers as they can now put more money towards school loans and the development of their education.
- At YMCA Christ Child, there are 2 out of 5 teachers who qualified for the teachers grant. The grant has made a difference to the teachers. Also Florence Malone, Brittnei Pina and Brandi Harris continued support and assistance was highlighted.

4. Public Comments:

There were no public comments made.

5. Committee Updates:

5.1 Tuition Assistance:

Florence Malone presented the following update:

- CPP continues to hold monthly "Pastries for Preschoolers". This is a family engagement initiative where Board Members get a chance to talk to parents and providers at centers as well as see the difference in different quality centers and the needs that the different centers require.
- CPP has 52 centers and need Board members to come out and support the pastries for preschoolers as this is an opportunity to speak to families and centers. Wesley Education for Children and Families is scheduled for April 3rd.
- Florence Malone will send out a schedule of future dates to the Board members.
- CPP has 52 centers participating in tuition assistance with Divine Day Center being the latest to be approved today. They have achieved a 3 star step up to quality rating, are eligible for tuition assistance and are located in Walnut Hills.
- We also added Nurse Julie's Childcare to our list of TA providers.
- In total, since CPP's inception, we have enrolled 2955 children cumulative with 967 community providers.
- Outreach enrollment starts April 5 and we are scheduling visits to get the children re-enrolled for the coming year.
- Popsicles for Preschoolers event will start up at various neighborhoods. This is a community engagement initiative where we pop up with popsicles in hopes in getting more information to families about CPP.

- Tomorrow, March 20 is our second annual provider luncheon which will be held at United Way of Greater Cincinnati, Community Room B&C from 11:30 am to 1:30 pm. We have RSVP for 40 people and invite Board members to attend, if they wish.

5.2 Executive Committee:

5.2.1 Draft Equity Plan:

- Father Graham mentioned that the Executive Committee had reviewed the draft equity plan at the last meeting and had decided the draft will be brought to the Board for feedback this month and for approval at next April Board meeting.
- The document is theoretical document that once it is approved, the CPP team will build out what this means in terms of the various work streams.
- Lauren Shifman who is responsible for this body of work mentioned the Cincinnati Public School equity document was used as the foundation of the document.
- Comments were asked of the Board Member concerning the document.

COMMENTS/RECOMMENDATIONS:

- Yousuf Ahmad suggested the word equity is defined in the document as it has different meanings depending on the context.
- Following Yousuf Ahmad comment, Shiloh Turner stated a copy of CPS equity document will be provided with CPP draft policy so that the Board has an idea on what the draft was built upon.
- Laura Sanregret enquired if the final policy will go to CPS policy committee.
- Father Graham stated the document will be shared with the CPS policy committee.
- The document along with underlying CPS document will be shared with the Board. Board members are encouraged to share comments with Lauren and Shiloh prior to the policy coming to the April Board meeting.

5.2.2 Evaluation for Executive Director:

- Board members should have received the evaluation documents from Father Graham's assistant, Mary Lang.
- There were three attachments emailed out with one being the evaluation tool, the others containing the OGSM document and a summary of accomplishments to date.
- It is requested that Board members return their *completed feedback form back to Father Graham by April 5, 2019.*

5.3 The Cost of Quality:

5.3.1 Wage Pilot Program:

- A map of the wage pilot program recipients distribution has been generated as per Cincinnati Promise Forward request. If you require a copy, please contact Lauren Shifman.
- CPP is currently in the process of working on the evaluation of the equity of the implementation of the wage pilot program. This will be shared with the Board in April.
- There will be significant amendments to the application process of the current wage program, which opens up on April 1, in order to remove barriers for teachers applying.
- In terms of the 0 to 2 star quality QI proposed wage pilot program, legal counsel is still reviewing the draft.

5.3.2 P4EC Wage Feedback:

Lauren Shifman meet with P4EC (people for early childhood) who presented feedback from people from early childhood. Ellen Vera and Bianca Edwards of P4EC are here today to present the feedback to the CPP Board.

DISCUSSION:

- Yousuf Ahmad asked what percentage of people leave for CPS to earn the \$23 per hour as mentioned in the presentation, as opposed to the \$12 per hour at CPP.
- Ellen Vera responded that they do not have the actual data but based the response on what teachers have informed them.
- Yousuf Ahmad requested data (real facts) to be presented in order for the CPP Board to make a decision on the presented recommendations.
- Christine Fisher cautioned the use of saying CPP pays \$12 per hour as CPP is not a school district nor is it is a community provider so there can really be no comparison.
- Sallie Westheimer asked around the proposed timeline presented and the statement made by Bianca Edwards and Ellen Vera that if the CPP proposal does not met the satisfaction of P4EC, this will be taken to CPS Board. She asked if this is a demand from P4EC.
- Ellen Vera responded that stakeholders are frustrated at the \$2000 per recipient wage pilot program which they do not feel is fulfilling the promise made to them. Ellen affirmed this is a demand from P4EC.
- Anthony Hobson asked how 146 teachers impacted, as presented in the promised P4EC 0 to 2 star Wage Pilot suggestions, was calculated.
- Ellen Vera responded that P4EC had based that figure on the \$1.6 million allocated that would get those teachers up to \$15 per hour.
- Leshia Lyman asked about the recommendations on the timeline from moving the wage pilot from 2 years to 2 to 3 months. She asked what had driven P4EC to shorten the length of the window given that CPP is trying to learn from the wage piece.
- Ellen Vera responded that originally it was six months but given people's concern that things are not moving along faster enough and it is near the end of the second year and nothing is been done in terms of fulfilling the promise, the window was shorted.
- Sallie Westheimer asked whether P4EC will consider joint collaboration with CPP in order to achieve the best possible goal for majority as opposed to the current demand.
- Deborah Allsop agreed with Sallie Westheimer sentiment and said, in regards to the proposed timeline, there is no room for negotiation and there has to be a point where both parties can come together to reach a common goal.
- Christine Fisher stated there is still more work that needs to be done on the wage issue but it should be acknowledged what CPP has accomplished not only on the wages but as a whole and the promise is bigger than the wage issue. She urged more work be done to improve community messaging that highlights the work of CPP and its accomplishments to date. The bigger picture needs to be communicated to the public.
- Yousuf Ahmad suggested CPP Board look at what can be done in the next budgeting cycle whilst acknowledging there is still further work that needs to be done on the wage piece before decisions can be made.
- Cheryl Rose stated whilst acknowledging the importance of the wage issue, CPP monies is tax payers monies and the CPP Board has an obligation to ensure tax payers monies is used for the correct public purposes.

RECOMMENDATION: Father Graham asked the Finance & Audit Committee to look at, against the Quality Improvement work, what can be done with the wage assistance piece.

5.4 **Community Engagement:**

LaKeisa Ealy provided the following update:

- From various meetings with organizations and stakeholders, there is a need for clear concise information to be provided to clear up any misconceptions about CPP. This is where the community engagement plan will come into play.
- The community engagement plan will focus on the cost of quality, quality improvement and tuition assistance which are the three main bodies of work at CPP and are the areas where most conversations with stakeholders and organizations is taking place.
- The community engagement plan is available for review and Board members can email LaKeisa Ealy for a copy.
- We are also in the process of putting Quality Improvement advertisements on the bus lines and the first advertisement will be rolled out on April 5.
- CPP will also listing any job vacancies that providers might have on our website.
- CPP will be highlighting staff and other members like providers on social media and would like to feature Board members as well.
- On May 4, there will be a new website launch providing more transparency and data.
- The Billboard campaign will be launching in various communities to encourage visibility of CPP.
- A newsletter will be launched April 1 that will highlight tuition assistance, cost of quality and quality improvement work.
- Christine Fisher requested talking points be drafted for Board members so when they are out in the public that they are conveying one message.
- Father Graham requested LaKeisa distribute the community engagement plan to the Board and a further discussion around community engagement take place at the April Board meeting.

5.5 **Finance & Audit:**

5.5.1 Final Audit Report:

A motion to approve the final audit report was made by Yousuf Ahmad and seconded by Deborah Allsop. The motion was unanimously approved.

5.5.2 Final Results to date:

- There is one adjustment this month with a significant adjustment of ~\$550k in the underspend. This was due to a spreadsheet error in that the CPS system was tracking more students than the number receiving tuition assistance. Héctor Polanco has made the adjustment.
- Father Graham requested a chart of Quality Improvement spending over the life of the CPP, similar to the tuition assistance enrollment chart that was presented today.

5.6 **Quality Improvement update:**

Brittnii Pina presented the following update:

- CPP has 93 providers involved in Quality Improvement.
- We have utilized half million dollars of the Quality Improvement funds so far with 50% of providers in the quality gap areas and the other half in the non gap areas.

- We are one seat short of reaching our 200 goal for the year.

6. Executive Director Update:

Shiloh Turner presented the following update:

- United Way of Greater Cincinnati have waived their 2019 administrative fee saving ~200K.
- 95 preschools participating in Tuition Assistance with 43 in CPS and 51 community based providers.
- Significant community updates and presentations with Shiloh Turner continue to take place with regular meetings with CPS Board happening.
- CPP met with the African American Chambers around shared services opportunities.
- The Executive Committee discussed Emily Lewis transition plan strategy and feel confident there will be more likely be a reduction in the contract fee.

7. Observers Comments:

The following comments were made:

- Leshia Lyman suggested, in terms of P4EC presentation, instead of coming to the Board, a committee might be the better avenue for the parties to work together and come together to reach a common goal.
- Vera Brooks stated she would share the equity plan with the policy committee for transparency and communication. With regard to the P4EC presentation CPS would not be putting money to areas that do not cover preschoolers exclusively as the money is exclusive for preschoolers 3 and 4 years old.

8. Adjourn:

A motion to adjourn was made by Cheryl Rose and seconded by Sallie Westheimer at 5:57 PM. The motion was unanimously approved.

Submitted by Lesley Nunn, Senior Administrative Assistant

Future Board Meetings:

April 16, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
May 16, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
June 13, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
August 13, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
September 19, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
October 24, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
November 19, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM
December 12, 2019 – 4:00 to 6:00 PM